

**Empire State Stem Cell Board
Funding Committee Meeting Minutes
November 16, 2012**

The Empire State Stem Cell Board held a meeting on Friday, November 16, 2012, at the offices of the Department of Health, 90 Church Street, New York, New York. Janet Cohn, J.D., presided as Chair Designee.

Funding Committee Members Present:

Ms. Janet Cohn, Chairperson Designee
Dr. Bradford Berk*
Mr. Robin Elliott
Dr. David Hohn*
Dr. Richard Gronostajski*
Dr. Mario Loomis
Dr. Samuel Packer
Dr. Allen Spiegel, Vice Chair
Dr. Dr. Michael Stocker
Ms. Madelyn Wils
*participated via video-conference

Department of Health Staff Present:

Ms. Bonnie Brautigam
Dr. Kathy Chou
Dr. Matthew Kohn
Ms. Lakia Rucker
Dr. Jill Taylor

Observers Present:

Mr. Robert Feldman
Ms. Julia Gelman
Ms. Kristin Smith

Welcome and Introductions

Ms. Cohn called the meeting to order and welcomed Board members, staff and the public. She advised members that Dr. Shah, who was overseeing the Department's response to Hurricane Sandy, was unavailable for the meeting because he was attending an emergency preparedness conference which had been convened in the wake of the storm. Ms. Cohn then read a delegation executed by Dr. Shah, pursuant to Public Health Law Section 2068, in which he granted her authority to exercise his rights and duties in his absence.

Ms. Cohn welcomed Dr. Samuel Packer, also a member of the Ethics Committee, as the newest member of the Funding Committee. She then asked members and staff to introduce themselves.

Approval of Minutes for the September 24, 2012, Funding Committee Meeting

Ms. Cohn directed members to the draft minutes of the September 24, 2012, meeting of the Funding Committee and asked for a motion to approve them. Dr. Packer so moved and Dr. Spiegel seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Motion to Convene in Executive Session

Ms. Cohn asked committee members for a motion to go into executive session to discuss the evaluations of applications submitted in response to the Requests for Applications (RFAs) for Consortia to Accelerate Therapeutic Applications of Stem Cells. Dr. Spiegel so moved and Dr. Stocker seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Cohn then requested that members of the public and non-essential staff leave the room.

Executive Session

Ms. Cohn noted that a few members of the Committee would need to recuse themselves for discussion of specific applications, but that Dr. Taylor would first provide members with information about the evaluation process and would then review those applications for which there were no conflicts of interest. Ms. Brautigam reminded members of the evaluation criteria included in the RFA and described the peer review evaluation and scoring process.

Several Committee members expressed concern about funding research applications which would not likely be successful in meeting their stated aims. Additionally, members communicated their desire that any unused funds be reinvested in future NYSTEM RFAs.

The Committee then discussed each eligible application at length after members with potential conflicts of interest left the room.

Motion to Adjourn Executive Session

Ms. Cohn then asked for a motion to adjourn the executive session and reconvene in public. A motion was made and seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Public Session - Recommendations for Approval of Awards

Ms. Cohn advised the Committee that the next order of business would be to vote on applications for Consortia to Accelerate Therapeutic Applications of Stem Cells awards. She reminded members that those who had identified conflicts of interest would be required to leave the room during discussion and voting on those applications.

Ms. Brautigam provided an overview of the evaluation criteria and process. She reminded members that they had established a score of 2.5 as the cutoff and that seven

applications were therefore eligible for their consideration. She further noted that they had established Significance and Impact as the tiebreaker, but that they could also consider responsiveness to the mission of the Board, responsiveness to the RFA itself, programmatic balance, and availability of funds, when considering whether to fund a given application; and that the committee was not obligated to recommend funding at all, although the RFA designated up to \$80 million for approximately five awards.

Dr. Taylor then announced the application number and title, the applicant institution, the principal investigator and subcontractor organizations for eligible applications, as follows:

App #	PI	Sponsoring Institution	Proposal Title	Recusals
N11C-012	Temple, Sally	Regenerative Research Foundation	The Retinal Stem Cell Consortium	Drs. Berk and Shah

Dr. Packer moved to recommend approval of the award in the amount recommended by staff. Dr. Stocker seconded the motion. The motion passed.

App #	PI	Sponsoring Institution	Proposal Title	Recusals
N11C-008	Studer, Lorenz	Memorial Sloan-Kettering Institute for Cancer Research	Developing A Human Embryonic Stem Cell Derived Dopamine Neuron Source For Cell Therapy In Parkinson's Disease	Mr. Elliott

Dr. Spiegel moved to recommend approval of the award in the amount recommended by staff. Dr. Stocker seconded the motion and Dr. Loomis abstained. The motion passed.

App #	PI	Sponsoring Institution	Proposal Title	Recusals
N11C-006	Jubelt, Berk	SUNY Upstate Medical Center	Oligodendrocyte Progenitor Cell Delivery For Restoration Of Function In Multiple Sclerosis	Drs. Berk and Gronostajski

Dr. Spiegel moved to recommend approval of the award in the amount recommended by staff. Dr. Stocker seconded the motion and Dr. Loomis abstained. The motion passed.

App #	PI	Sponsoring Institution	Proposal Title	Recusals
N11C-013	Jordan, Craig	Rochester University	Therapeutic Targeting Of Cancer Stem Cells	Drs. Berk, Shah & Hohn

All members unanimously voted against supporting this application. Dr. Spiegel stated that Board members felt that this particular application was not sufficiently responsive to the

goals of the RFA in that, rather than cell therapy, it involved small-molecule treatment in a way that did not advance the goals of the NYSTEM program.

Dr. Taylor advised members that there were three applications tied with a score of 2.5. She noted that the RFA stipulates that in the event of a tie the Committee consider the score for Significance and Impact. She then provided members with the following information:

App #	PI	Sponsoring Institution	Proposal Title	Recusals
N11C-015	Rafii, Shahin	Weill Medical College, Cornell University	Translation Of A Vascular Niche Platform To A Clinical Scale Expansion Of Hematopoetic Stem And Progenitor Cells.	Drs. Berk and Shah
N11C014	Cohen, Ira	SUNY Stonybrook	Stem Cell Therapies For Cardiac Arrhythmias	Dr. Shah
N11C-003	Brunken, William	SUNY Downstate Medical Center	Ocular Tissue Repair And Vision Restoration With Stem Cells On Biomimetic Support Structures	Dr. Berk

The Committee voted against funding the three tied applications.

Dr. Spiegel stated that the Board was extremely circumspect in reviewing the Consortia applications and had determined that the three most scientifically meritorious were worthy of funding. He noted that the Committee strongly recommends that another RFA be issued promptly, giving other applicants the benefit of the reviews so that they might submit improved applications and better achieve NYSTEM's goals.

Adjourn

Ms. Cohn then asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting of the Funding Committee. Dr. Packer made a motion and Dr. Stocker seconded. The motion passed.

*s/ Janet Cohn
Executive Secretary to the
Empire State Stem Cell Board
Approved:*