

**Empire State Stem Cell Board**  
**Funding Committee Meeting Minutes**  
**May 21, 2010**

The Empire State Stem Cell Board Funding Committee held a meeting on Friday, May 21, 2010, at the Department of Health offices, 90 Church Street, New York, New York. Commissioner Richard F. Daines, M.D., presided as Chairperson.

**Funding Committee Members Present:**

Dr. Richard F. Daines, Chairperson

Mr. Kenneth Adams

Dr. Bradford Berk\*

Mr. Robin Elliott

Dr. David Hohn, Vice Chair\*

Dr. Bruce Holm\*

\*via videoconference

Dr. Hilda Hutcherson

Dr. Mario Loomis

Dr. Allen Spiegel

Dr. Michael Stocker

Ms. Madelyn Wils

**Funding Committee Members Absent:**

Dr. Gerald Fischbach

**Ethics Committee Members Present:**

Fr. Thomas Berg

Dr. Samuel Gorovitz

Dr. Robert Klitzman

Rev. H. Hugh Maynard-Reid

Dr. Samuel Packer

**Department of Health Staff Present:**

Dr. David Anders

Ms. Bonnie Brautigam

Dr. Cathy Chou

Mr. Thomas Conway

Ms. Judy Doesschate

Dr. Matthew Kohn

Ms. Beth Roxland

Ms. Lakia Rucker

Dr. Lawrence Sturman

Dr. Ann Willey

**Observers Present:**

Ms. Laurel DeGeorge

Ms. Ellen Ferranti

Mr. Samuel Gandy

Ms. Anna Granat

Ms. Susie Han

Ms. Shauna Katz

Mr. David Levy

Ms. Caroline Marshall

Mr. David McKeon

Ms. Barbara Meara

Ms. Kelly Ryan

Mr. Thomas Sakmar

Ms. Carrie Zoubul

**Motion to Convene in Executive Session**

Dr. Daines asked for a motion to go into executive session to discuss the evaluations of the applications submitted in response to the Requests for Applications (RFA) for Fellow to Faculty awards and Shared Research Facilities. Dr. Stocker so moved and Dr. Spiegel seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Dr. Daines then asked members of the public and non-essential staff to leave the room and advised them that the Committee was expected to reconvene in public session at approximately 11:00 a.m.

### **Executive Session**

Dr. Sturman and Ms. Brautigam provided members with information about the evaluation and scoring process for applications submitted in response to the RFA for Fellow to Faculty awards and then reviewed the applications for which there were no conflicts of interest. The Committee then reviewed similar information for applications for which there were conflicts of interest while members who were identified as having a potential conflict of interest recused themselves and left the room during consideration of those applications. The Committee considered the evaluations of the applications submitted in response to the RFA for Shared Facilities with members having a conflict of interest leaving the room during consideration of those particular applications.

### **Motion to Adjourn Executive Session**

Dr. Daines then asked for a motion to adjourn the executive session and reconvene in public. Dr. Spiegel so moved and Dr. Stocker seconded the motion. The motion passed.

### **Public Session - Opening Remarks and Introductions**

Dr. Daines called the meeting to order and welcomed Board members, staff and the public. Dr. Daines introduced the Funding Committee's newest member, Dr. Mario Loomis, who was appointed by the Governor upon nomination by the Assembly Minority Leader. He noted that Dr. Loomis is a Board-certified plastic surgeon practicing in Middletown, New York. He advised members that Dr. Loomis has also traveled to Honduras with a surgical team sponsored by [Light of the World Charities](#) and [The Franciscan Friars of the Renewal](#) to provide free surgery to the poor. He then offered Dr. Loomis the floor to make any additional comments.

Dr. Loomis said that he was pleased to be appointed to the Board. He said he is very passionate about medicine and science and helping people and that he sensed that that passion was shared by everyone in the room. He stated that his position regarding the use of human embryos in stem cell research is not based upon a religious or personal view, but on a commitment to human rights and the desire to apply that concept to all human beings, including embryos in a petri dish. He said he has been impressed with the quality of the people on the Board, funded scientists and the peer reviews and that he expected that the State's funding initiative and the Board will achieve new heights in stem cell science and therapies and will eventually do it without compromising human rights. He said that he is impressed with the thoughtfulness and the thoroughness of the Board members, under whom the entire project has been undertaken and managed. He closed saying he was honored to be a part of the Board.

Dr. Daines thanked Dr. Loomis for his comments and stated that he looks forward to Dr. Loomis' participation on the Board.

Dr. Daines advised members that Dr. Dutton has resigned from the Funding Committee because he has moved to Worcester, Massachusetts, where he will be a Professor in the Department of Pathology for the University of Massachusetts Medical School. Dr. Daines noted that Dr. Dutton had been with the Board since its inception and that his experience and insights have been very helpful in shaping the Empire State Stem Cell Board and the NYSTEM program. He extended the Board's appreciation for his dedicated service and wished him and his wife well as they move to their new home and undertake new challenges in their careers.

Dr. Daines also advised members that two of the Board's alumni have been appointed to key positions by President Obama: Dr. Sulmasy was appointed to the Presidential Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues; and Dr. Varmus was named as Director of the National Cancer Institute.

Dr. Daines then asked members and staff to introduce themselves.

### **Approval of Minutes for the March 4, 2010, Funding Committee Meeting**

Following the introductions, Dr. Daines directed members to the draft minutes for the March 4, 2010, meeting of the Funding Committee that were included in their agenda packets and asked for a motion to approve the minutes. Dr. Spiegel so moved and Mr. Adams seconded the motion. The motion passed.

### **Recommendations for Approval of Fellow to Faculty and Shared Facility Awards**

Dr. Daines advised the Committee that it would be voting on the Committee's recommendations for awards to applicants who responded to the RFA for funding of Fellow to Faculty awards. Dr. Daines noted that the applications were reviewed by a panel of independent experts from outside New York State and that summaries of the reviews were discussed by the Funding Committee in executive session.

Ms. Brautigam provided a brief overview of the evaluation criteria and process. Dr. Daines advised members that they would first act on the recommendation of Fellow to Faculty awards for which no Committee members had declared a conflict of interest and then take up the application for which a member of the Committee had a conflict of interest. Dr. Sturman then provided the Committee with the following information regarding the applications that were being recommended for funding for which there were no conflicts of interest:

App #	Sponsoring Institution	PI	Proposal Title	Recommended Funding
N09F-006	The Rockefeller University	Ting Chen, Ph.D.	Regulation of Hair Follicle Stem Cell Maintenance and Activation	\$1,078,500
N09F-002	Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center	Lan Wang, Ph.D.	Determining the effects and mechanisms of Id1 on leukemia stem cells	\$1,078,500

Dr. Stocker moved to recommend approval of the awards in the amounts recommended by staff. Dr. Spiegel seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Dr. Hutcherson then recused herself and left the room during consideration of the following application:

App #	Sponsoring Institution	PI	Proposal Title	Recommended Funding
N09F-003	The Trustees of the University of Columbia in the City of New York	Donald Freytes, Ph.D.	Optimizing dynamic interactions between hESC-derived cardiac patch and inflammatory cells	\$1,076,799

Dr. Stocker moved to recommend approval of the award in the amount recommended by staff. Dr. Spiegel seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Dr. Hutcherson returned to the room. Dr. Daines advised the Committee that it would be voting on the Committee's recommendations for awards to applicants who responded to the RFA for funding of Shared Facilities by acting first on the applications for which there were no conflicts of interest, followed by those for which a conflict of interest had been declared. Dr. Sturman then provided the Committee with the following information for the applications that were being recommended for funding for which there were no conflicts of interest:

App #	Sponsoring Institution	PI	Proposal Title	Recommended Funding
N09S-006	The Research Foundation of SUNY/ SUNY at Stony Brook	Wadie Bahou, Ph.D.	Shared Facilities for the Stony Brook Stem Cell Center	\$5,503,554
N09S-007	Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute	Glenn Monastersky, Ph.D.	An Upstate New York Shared Facility for Basic Stem Cell Research	\$2,450,561
N09S-010	Cornell University	Andrew Yen, Ph.D.	Flow Cytometry Core Laboratory to Support Stem Cell Research	\$1,102,829

Dr. Spiegel moved to recommend approval of the awards in the amounts recommended by staff. Dr. Stocker seconded the motion. The motion passed.

The Committee then considered the following application for which there was no conflict of interest:

App #	Sponsoring Institution	PI	Proposal Title	Recommended Funding
N09S-012	New York University School of Medicine	Ramanuj DasGupta, Ph.D.	Developing an integrated platform for siRNA and shRNA-based genome-scale screens in eukaryotic stem cells	\$5,436,929

Dr. Spiegel moved to recommend approval of the award in the amount recommended by staff, provided that complete justification of the budget is provided or the amount of the award is reduced. Dr. Stocker seconded the motion. The motion passed.

The Committee then took up consideration of the following application while Dr. Hutcherson recused herself and left the room:

App #	Sponsoring Institution	PI	Proposal Title	Recommended Funding
N09S-004/N08S-003	The Trustees of the University of Columbia/Columbia University Medical Center	Christopher Henderson, Ph.D.	High-Throughput Screening and Chemistry Shared Facility	\$5,874,675

Dr. Stocker moved to recommend approval of the award in the amount recommended by staff. Dr. Loomis seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Dr. Hutcherson returned to the room and Dr. Berk recused himself and left the room during consideration of the following application:

App #	Sponsoring Institution	PI	Proposal Title	Recommended Funding
N09S-001/N08S-022	University of Rochester	Stephen Dewhurst, Ph.D.	Upstate Stem Cell cGMP Facility	\$3,331,362

Dr. Spiegel moved to recommend approval of the award in the amount recommended by staff. Dr. Loomis seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Dr. Berk returned to the room and Drs. Hohn and Holm recused themselves and left the room during consideration of the following application:

App #	Sponsoring Institution	PI	Proposal Title	Recommended Funding
N09S-003/N08S-015	The Research Foundation of SUNY/University at Buffalo	Richard Gronostajski, Ph.D.	Western New York Stem Cell Culture and Analysis Center	\$3,564,599

Dr. Spiegel moved to recommend approval of the award in the amount recommended by staff. Dr. Loomis seconded the motion. The motion passed. Following the vote, Drs. Hohn and Holm returned to the room.

Dr. Daines confirmed with Ms. Brautigam that the recommendations made by the Committee had exhausted the available funding for this RFA and advised members that the voting on the Shared Facilities applications had concluded.

### **RFA Pre-College Science Teacher Summer Experience Awards**

Dr. Daines then turned the floor over to Dr. Sturman to review the changes that staff had made to the proposed RFA for Pre-College Science Teacher Summer Experience Awards based upon the feedback provided at the last meeting.

Dr. Sturman advised the Committee that the RFA had been changed as a result of Committee's discussions at the last meeting and follow-up discussions with Dr. Hohn to: 1. increase flexibility regarding the duration of the program so that it could be for six to eight weeks; 2. added deliverables, including requiring opportunities for follow-up meetings of the

participants and possible attendance at NYSTEM's annual scientific meetings; and 3. increased flexibility in the allowed expenditures to provide support for the mentor and housing, as needed. He noted that the funding could support as many as 80 teachers at 8 to 16 sites.

Dr. Hohn commented that the RFA had been amended to address most of his concerns. Dr. Berk commented that the RFA was much improved, but that he remained concerned that this may not be as successful as other approaches to achieve the goal of reaching secondary education students. He suggested that the funding be limited in the first round and that the resulting programs undergo a rigorous review process so that the impact can be assessed before additional funding is made available for this program. Dr. Sturman noted that Dr. Hohn has suggested that another RFA be prepared to fund the development of stem cell curriculum for secondary science education courses. Dr. Maynard-Reid suggested that efforts be made to encourage the involvement of the broadest segment of society in stem cell research and education initiatives.

Dr. Sturman noted that the RFA provided that applications scoring between 2.6 - 5.0 would not be eligible for funding. Dr. Gorovitz stated that he was very supportive of this proposal and encouraged members to give the projects time to be fully developed and implemented before attempting to assess the value of the program. He also commented that he thought the Board's educational initiatives are encouraging the development of new cross-discipline relationships and collaborations that have conveyed significant benefits beyond the funding being made available for specific projects.

Dr. Daines asked for a motion to approve the RFA. Dr. Spiegel so moved and Dr. Loomis seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

## **Adjourn**

Dr. Daines then asked for a motion to adjourn the Funding Committee meeting. Dr. Stocker so moved. Dr. Loomis seconded the motion. The motion passed.

*s/ Judy L. Doesschate, Esq.  
Executive Secretary to the  
Empire State Stem Cell Board  
Approved: September 17, 2010*